

Adran yr Economi a'r Seilwaith  
Department for Economy and Infrastructure



---

Llywodraeth Cymru  
Welsh Government

**APPLICATION FOR LISTED BUILDING CONSENT UNDER SECTION 10  
OF THE PLANNING (LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS)  
ACT 1990  
REFERRED TO WELSH MINISTERS BY DIRECTION UNDER SECTION 12**

**APPLICATION BY: WELSH MINISTERS**

**SITE: WOODLAND HOUSE (KNOWN LOCALLY AS THE MAGOR  
VICARAGE), NEWPORT ROAD, MAGOR, MONMOUTHSHIRE, NP26 3BZ**

**Proof of Evidence**

**Mick Rawlings BA, MCIfA**

**Welsh Government, Cultural Heritage**

**Document Reference: WG1.9.4**

**Contents**

1. Personal Statement.....	1
2. Scope of Evidence .....	3
3. The Scheme.....	4
4. The Application Listed Building .....	4
5. The Impact and Effect of Demolition.....	9
6. Summary.....	12

**1. Personal Statement**

- 1.1 My name is Mick Rawlings and I hold the role of Technical Director (Historic Environment) at RPS Planning and Development, a division of RPS Group plc. I have a BA Honours Degree in Archaeology and Geography, awarded in 1985 by the University of Southampton. I have been a full Member of the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (formerly the Institute for Archaeologists) since 1997 and was an Associate Member of the Institute from 1990 to 1997.
- 1.2 I have been employed as a professional within the cultural heritage and historic environment sector since completing my degree in 1985. From 1989 until 2004 I worked for Wessex Archaeology, an archaeological contracting and consulting organisation based in Salisbury, Wiltshire. During that period I had several roles, eventually as a Senior Project Manager. I worked on more than a hundred development schemes and gave evidence at both public and local plan inquiries.
- 1.3 Transport infrastructure schemes in which I was involved as a manager included the M4/M49 motorway links to the Second Severn Crossing (the English Approaches), the A34 Newbury Bypass (Berkshire), the A3 Liphook to Petersfield Bypass (Hampshire), the A380 Kingskerswell Bypass (Devon) and the Channel Tunnel Rail Link (Kent, Essex and Greater London).
- 1.4 Since 2004 I have been employed by RPS Planning and Development, initially as a Principal Consultant and subsequently as a Technical Director. During my period of employment with RPS I have been involved in several major highway schemes.

- 1.5 I was the Highways Agency's Archaeologist during the construction of the A30 Bodmin to Indian Queens scheme (Cornwall), the Contractor's Archaeologist for the A354 Weymouth Relief Road (Dorset) and the County Council's expert witness at the Public Inquiry for the proposed A350 Westbury Eastern Bypass (Wiltshire). I was the Key Technical Discipline Leader for Cultural Heritage on the Stansted Surface Access scheme regarding the widening of the M11 motorway and provision of new junctions on the A120(T) (Essex) and also Key Technical Discipline Leader for Cultural Heritage with regard to the optioneering study for surface access associated with the proposed third runway at Heathrow Airport (Greater London). I acted as the Contractor's Expert for archaeology with regard to a mediated settlement for a claim brought against the Department for Regional Development in connection with the DBFO2 roads programme in Northern Ireland.
- 1.6 I am currently the Scheme Archaeologist for the dualling of Section 2 of the A465 Heads of the Valley Road in South Wales (Gilwern to Brynmawr), having been involved right through the preparation and submission of draft Orders and having prepared and given evidence at the Public Local Inquiry ahead of the Orders being duly made. This scheme is now under construction and the agreed programme of archaeological work is being implemented in full.
- 1.7 With regard to other transport infrastructure schemes I am currently one of two Key Technical Discipline Leaders for Cultural Heritage providing advice on the proposed second runway at Gatwick Airport (Sussex and Surrey). Previously I was seconded to Crossrail Ltd to provide specialist cultural heritage input into the preparation of documents of documents to support the Hybrid Bill submission for that scheme.

- 1.8 I was a member of the Institute for Archaeologists (IfA) working group reviewing guidance and policy on the issue of the settings of heritage assets, and was part of the IfA team which met with, and provided comments to, English Heritage ahead of the publication of their first guidance document on this matter in October 2011.
- 1.9 I have prepared historic environment documents to accompany applications for a number of major developments that have the potential to cause change within the settings of multiple heritage assets.
- 1.10 I have been the team leader for cultural heritage on the M4CaN scheme since the Costain/Vinci/Taylor Woodrow Construction Joint Venture (CJV) along with the Design Joint Venture, (DJV - Arup and Atkins supported by RPS) was awarded the ECI contract by Welsh Government in March 2015, having advised the CJV team during the tendering process. I am responsible for all of the output relating to this topic that has been submitted in support of the draft Orders.
- 1.11 The evidence which I have prepared and provide in this proof of evidence is true and has been prepared and is given in accordance with the code of conduct of my professional institute and I confirm that the opinions expressed are my true and professional opinions.

## **2. Scope of Evidence**

- 2.1 My evidence is concerned with the significance of the listed building and the impacts and effects on this significance resulting from the construction and operation of the published M4 Corridor around Newport Scheme (the Scheme).

### **3. The Scheme**

- 3.1 The need for the Scheme and the alternatives considered are described in the Proof of Evidence of Mr Matthew Jones (WG1.1.6) and in more detail in his Proof of Evidence for the public inquiry into the Orders under the Highways Act (WG1.1.1). He also explains the background to the Listed Building Consent application and why it has been ‘called-in’ for consideration alongside the public inquiry into the Orders under the Highways Act for the M4CaN Scheme.
- 3.2 In his Proof of Evidence (WG1.23.4) Mr John Davies describes the policy background to the M4CaN Scheme and also the policy relevant to the Listed Building Consent.

### **4. The Application Listed Building**

- 4.1 Woodland House (also known locally as the ‘Vicarage’) is located to the north of Newport Road (B4245), west of Magor, in Monmouthshire. The property sits in its own grounds of approximately 0.45 hectares with external tree belts forming the perimeter to the north, east and west. Beyond the tree belts is agricultural land (currently pasture) and then highways to the north and west (M4 motorway and A4810 respectively). To the south is a hedged boundary separating the property from the B4245 Newport Road.

- 4.2 The house was constructed in 1861 as a vicarage; it is now owned by Welsh Government and is let on a residential tenancy. It comprises a two storey dwelling with five first floor bedrooms along with en-suite and family bathrooms. The ground floor has a front porch, hallway, sitting room, dining room, study, kitchen, larder, cloakroom, and scullery. There is a small cellar beneath the scullery. A relatively recent extension to the north-east provides a single storey conservatory accessed via the kitchen, whilst a much earlier single storey extension to the north-west appears to be a former external wash-house and toilet.
- 4.3 Immediately to the north-west of the house is a former coach-house and stable which seems to have been contemporary with the principal building (i.e. 1861). This is two storeys; a northern part has double-doors with a single hay-loft style door above, whilst the southern part (the former stable) has a single door and window in the elevation facing the house. This southern part has second floor storage accessed via the hay-loft above the northern part. The coach-house is in poor condition and is not in use; it is currently surrounded by Heras fencing and the roof has been covered with netting.
- 4.4 To the west of the house is a single storey detached double garage. This was constructed c. 2003/4 and the design is sympathetic to the principal residence, with scalloped barge boards echoing those on the porch of the house and also a finial on the pitched slate roof that replicates those used on the house.

- 4.5 Woodland House was listed in 1995 and the listing description (cited in full in Section 3.2 of the Welsh Government’s Statement of Case) states that the reason for designation is that the house is ‘*a good example of a largely unaltered mid 19<sup>th</sup> century architect designed vicarage with mostly contemporary fittings*’. The detached coach-house is ‘curtilage listed’ by virtue of being ancillary to the main building in the same ownership as the house at the time that the listing was made. This does not apply to the detached double garage as that had not been constructed at the time of the listing.
- 4.6 The listing description records that the house was designed by John Norton, the architect and restorer of Magor church. This refers to the Church of St Mary (originally dedicated to St Leonard), a Grade I listed building in the centre of Magor which has a 13<sup>th</sup> century chancel and central tower with the naves and aisle rebuilt in the 15<sup>th</sup> century in the Perpendicular style. This church was restored by John Norton in 1868, several years later than his work at Woodland House.
- 4.7 In the listing description, Woodland House is described as being in the Tudor/Jacobean Revival style. Notable exterior architectural elements referenced in the listing description include the porch with its steeply pitched roof, decorative bargeboards and cusped and pierced wooden tracery, also the pointed arched doorway with linenfold panelled door. Interior details include Tudor Revival style stone fireplaces, moulded panelled doors, panelling and shutters, and a pierced quatrefoil balustrade attached to the principal staircase.
- 4.8 John Norton (1823-1904) was a Bristol-born architect who took much of his inspiration from the designer and architect Augustus Pugin. Principally this meant an adherence to the early 19<sup>th</sup> century Gothic Revival style one which Pugin was one of the main exponents. Norton carried out a number of church renovations in the West Country and in South Wales in which the use of the Gothic pointed arch was a key element. For a while he was the Honorary Architect to the Diocese of Bath and Wells.



- 4.9 His most renowned work was at the substantial country house of Tyntesfield, south of Bristol. Here he remodelled an earlier house (Tyntes Place) into a huge Gothic Revival masterpiece which is now owned by the National Trust. Other residential commissions included smaller country houses at Nutley Priory (Surrey), Brent Knoll and Chewton Magna, as well as town houses along Crystal Palace Road in Sydenham. He designed Gwyn Hall (the principal civic building in Neath Port Talbot) and also the Church of St Helena on the island of Lundy in the Bristol Channel. One of his designs was the Imperial Hotel in Southampton (now South Western House) which was built in 1866 and is in a very distinct French Renaissance style.
- 4.10 Woodlands House was one of Norton's earlier commissions and came at a time just before he started his work at Tyntesfield. The vicarage here at Magor is much more in the restrained Tudor/Jacobean Revival style than the extravagant Gothic Revival style for which Norton became renowned. This may have been due to the function of the building (a vicarage) and its location in the traditionalist area of south Wales. However there are still some Gothic Revival elements present within the interior of the house. Photographs of the exterior and interior of the house, also the outbuildings, are provided within the Welsh Government's Statement of Case.
- 4.11 One of the two ornate fireplaces on the ground floor of Woodland House bears the date 1861 on one side and the initials A.C.S. on the other. The initials are almost certainly a reference to the Reverend Arthur Cardinal Saunders who was the vicar at the Church of St Mary in Magor for the period 1860 – 1881. He was the son of David Hugh Saunders of Steynton in Pembrokeshire and a graduate of Pembroke College, Oxford. He had been granted his Curate's licence in 1858 in Washingborough (Lincolnshire).

- 4.12 The 1<sup>st</sup> edition Ordnance Survey 6” (to the mile) map of the area was published in 1887 and shows Woodland House as ‘The Vicarage’. However the map also shows another Vicarage in Magor, close to St Mary’s Church. The likeliest explanation for the construction of the new vicarage at its location some way outside the village is that the incoming vicar (Arthur Cardinal Saunders) found the existing vicarage close to the church to be too small for his family and servants. Consequently he commissioned John Norton to design a grander property with larger grounds to meet his needs.
- 4.13 The initials on the fireplace are therefore important as they indicate that this was a private commission and not one emanating from the diocese. The vicar may well have had some say with regard to the design of the house.
- 4.14 Arthur Cardinal Saunders and his wife Jane (nee Poyntz) had two sons during his time at Woodlands House- Arthur Newdigate Saunders (b. 1863) and Nathaniel Argent Saunders (b. 1873). Later in life (1881) Arthur Cardinal Saunders moved to become the Rector at Lydiard Millicent in Wiltshire where he died in 1905.
- 4.15 The significance of Woodland House derives from its architectural qualities and from its association with a distinguished architect. There are aesthetic values related to the architecture and also some associative values that derive from the connection with the church of St Mary in Magor and with the vicar who almost certainly commissioned the building.

4.16 The setting of Woodland House does not make a very great contribution to its significance. The immediate setting of the ‘pocket park’ within which the building sits is of some value as it demonstrates the requirement for a house of this status to be placed within reasonable sized grounds as a statement of importance (compared with, for example, the smaller vicarage close to the church in Magor). However the wider setting takes in the roads which surround the property on three sides and also the built development in and around Magor that has been constructed since the vicarage was built. There is no visual connection between Woodland House and the church of St Mary, although the proximity of the vicarage to the village is still of some importance.

## **5. The Impact and Effect of Demolition**

5.1 The impact and effect in respect of the proposed demolition of Woodland House is described in Chapter 8 of the March 2016 Environmental Statement (Document 2.3.2). The Grade II listed vicarage is ascribed a Medium value in line with the methodology used in the assessment (which derives from DMRB). The magnitude of impact resulting from the demolition of the listed building and the associated curtilage listed building (the coach-house and stable) would be Major and the consequent significance of effect was assessed as Large adverse (paragraph 8.6.105 of the March 2016 ES). This is a significant effect.

5.2 A range of measures has been proposed to offset this effect. Consultation has been undertaken with the St Fagans National History Museum, Cardiff (a part of National Museum Wales) with a view to the relocation of Woodland House to St Fagans to form part of the permanent collection at that site. A response was received from St Fagans (03 November 2016) advising that the museum was not interested in taking Woodland House as *‘it doesn’t fit well within our collecting interests’*.

- 5.3 The Register of Environmental Commitments (Appendix SR18.1 of the December 2016 ES Supplement (Document 2.4.14)) includes a commitment (Ref. No. 111) to offer the Brooking National Collection the opportunity to acquire fixtures and fittings from Woodland House prior to demolition. This offer would include fixtures and fittings from the curtilage listed structures adjacent to the vicarage. The Brooking National Collection of Architectural Detail provides a teaching and reference resource for conservation professionals, architects, designers and craft apprentices. It also holds regular Open Days for interested members of the public.
- 5.4 Commitment Ref. No. 114 in the Register of Environmental Commitments (Appendix SR18.1 of the December 2016 ES Supplement (Document 2.4.14)) states that the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales (RCAHMW) would be offered the opportunity to record all buildings that would be demolished if the published M4CaN Scheme were to proceed. This would include Woodland House. Commitment Ref. No. 112 of the same Register provides a commitment to undertake pre-demolition recording of historic buildings in line with the methodologies set out in the Cultural Heritage Mitigation Plan (Appendix 8.10 of the March 2016 ES (Document 2.3.2)).
- 5.5 None of the measures above would reduce the assessed magnitude of impact and level (significance) of effect resulting from the demolition of Woodland House.

- 5.6 The Design Manual for Roads and Bridges (DMRB) suggests possible mitigation for the demolition of historic buildings. This includes relocation, re-building off-site as a museum exhibit, partial recovery of historic fabric for museum use or recording prior to demolition. Welsh Government's Statement of Case (for the Listed Building Consent application) indicated that the building is not of a level of significance that would justify the expense of rebuilding at a new location. Given the decision of the National History Museum to decline the offer to acquire Woodland House, the preferred mitigation (as reflected in the Register of Environmental Commitments) was a programme of detailed recording followed by architectural salvage.
- 5.7 However Welsh Government is aware of the concerns raised by Monmouthshire County Council in their Statement of Case and has written to the County Council with a view to identifying a potential suitable site for the relocation of Woodland House and the curtilage-listed coach-house and stable building. A meeting is to be held on 23 May 2017 to discuss possible sites for relocation. It must be emphasised that no suitable site has yet been identified and further feasibility studies would be required.
- 5.8 If relocation of Woodland House is undertaken, the assessment of impacts and effects recorded in the March 2016 Environmental Statement (Document 2.3.2) would need to be revised. The magnitude of impact would change from Major to Minor and the consequent level (significance) of effect would change from Large adverse (which is a significant effect) to Slight adverse (which is not a significant effect).

- 5.9 Welsh Government has sought advice from Cadw regarding the designation status of relocated listed buildings. The following statement was issued by Cadw on 06 April 2017 *'The Welsh Government's historic environment service, Cadw, has confirmed that any decision about whether the dismantled listed building retains its listing would be a matter for the Courts. However, they have advised that any relocation of Woodlands House would normally be controlled by strict conditions on a listed building consent. Providing that these conditions were properly discharged, and the listed building retains its special architectural interest, Cadw would make the necessary arrangements so that the building in its new location is listed'*.
- 5.10 In his Proof of Evidence (WG1.23.4) Mr John Davies discusses the appropriate conditions that should apply to the Listed Building Consent application as it currently stands. These do not include conditions relating to the relocation of Woodland House as such conditions would not be reasonable until further work has been undertaken regarding the identification of a suitable site and the feasibility of dismantling and rebuilding the vicarage and the contemporary coach-house and stable.

## 6. Summary

- 6.1 The demolition of the Grade II listed Woodland House (also known as Magor Vicarage) and the curtilage-listed former coach-house and stable is required in order to construct the M4 Corridor around Newport Scheme (the Scheme). An application for Listed Building Consent for this demolition was submitted to Monmouthshire County Council and subsequently 'called-in' for determination by Welsh Ministers.
- 6.2 Woodland House was built in 1861, most likely for the in-coming vicar of the Church of St Mary in Magor. The architect was John Norton, most renowned for his work in the Gothic Revival style, although this house is more in the Tudor/Jacobean Revival style.

- 
- 6.3 Demolition of the listed building (and the curtilage-listed outbuilding) would result in an impact of Major magnitude with a consequent Large adverse effect, which is a significant effect.
- 6.4 The proposed off-setting of this effect includes an invitation for the Brooking National Collection to acquire fixtures and fittings from the listed building prior to demolition, as well as a programme of detailed building recording. None of these measures would lead to a reduction in the assessed magnitude of impact and level (significance) of effect.
- 6.5 In response to concerns raised regarding the demolition of the listed building, Welsh Government has corresponded with Monmouthshire regarding the identification of potential suitable sites for the relocation of Woodland House. No such site has yet been clearly identified and further feasibility studies would be required before relocation is confirmed as a suitable mitigation strategy.
- 6.6 If relocation is acceptable and successful, the magnitude of impact with regard to the listed building would be Minor and the consequent level (significance) of effect would be Slight adverse.
- 6.7 I can confirm that this evidence represents my true and professional opinion.